

# INFINITE PROGENERATOR SUMS

ALBERTO FACCHINI AND LAWRENCE S. LEVY

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Let  $A, B$  be modules with semilocal endomorphism rings. If  $A^{(\aleph)} \cong B^{(\aleph)}$  (direct sum of  $\aleph$  copies) does it follow that  $A \cong B$ ? The answer is known to be “yes” when  $\aleph$  is a finite cardinal [F, Proposition 4.8]. This note was motivated by the question of whether the answer is still “yes” when  $\aleph = \aleph_0$  and (to make the question nontrivial)  $A$  and  $B$  are indecomposable. The answer to this  $\aleph_0$ -root question is “no”, even if we require  $A$  and  $B$  to be progenerators [Example 3.1], but is “yes” if we require  $A$  and  $B$  to be uniserial [P].

The starting point in the construction of our counterexample is a lemma, attributed to Eilenberg, stating that for every progenerator  $P$ , the module  $P^{(\aleph_0)}$  is free. This led us to the related question of whether *every* infinite direct sum of progenerators is free. The answer is “yes” if the ring is noetherian [B, Corollary 3.2], if “most” of the summands are isomorphic to each other [Corollary 2.2], or if the number of terms is “very large” [Corollary 2.3]. But the answer is “no” in general [Example 4.1].

## 2. GENERAL PROGENERATOR SUMS

We learned the following lemma and its proof from [C], where it is used to prove the interesting result that two rings are Morita equivalent if and only the infinite matrix rings over those rings are isomorphic.

**Lemma 2.1** (Eilenberg). *Let  $P, Q$  be progenerators over any ring, and  $\aleph$  any infinite cardinal. Then  $P^{(\aleph)} \cong Q^{(\aleph)}$  — equivalently,  $P^{(\aleph)}$  is free of rank  $\aleph$ .*

*Proof.* As  $P$  is a progenerator and  $Q$  is finitely generated, there is an epimorphism  $P^{(n)} \rightarrow Q$  for some  $n$ . Therefore, since  $Q$  is projective, we have  $Q \oplus Q' \cong P^{(n)}$  for some  $Q'$ . Taking the direct sum of  $\aleph$  copies of this isomorphism yields

$$(2.1.1) \quad Q^{(\aleph)} \oplus Q'^{(\aleph)} \cong P^{(\aleph)}$$

Substituting  $Q^{(\aleph)} \oplus Q^{(\aleph)}$  for  $Q^{(\aleph)}$  in (2.1.1) gives  $Q^{(\aleph)} \oplus Q^{(\aleph)} \oplus Q'^{(\aleph)} \cong P^{(\aleph)}$ . Therefore the isomorphism in (2.1.1) gives  $Q^{(\aleph)} \oplus P^{(\aleph)} \cong P^{(\aleph)}$ .

Reversing the roles of  $P$  and  $Q$  shows that  $Q^{(\aleph)} \oplus P^{(\aleph)} \cong Q^{(\aleph)}$ , and hence  $P^{(\aleph)} \cong Q^{(\aleph)}$ .  $\square$

---

*Date:* 1 July, 2004.

*1991 Mathematics Subject Classification.* 16D10, 16P40.

*Key words and phrases.* Progenerator,  $\aleph_0$ -root.

Facchini’s research was partially supported by Ministero dell’Istruzione, dell’Università e della Ricerca (Italy).

Levy’s research was partially supported by an NSA grant (USA).

The next Corollary follows from the so-called Eilenberg trick: if  $P$  is finitely generated projective, we have  $P \oplus Q \cong R^{(n)}$  for some finite  $n$ , therefore

$$\begin{aligned} P \oplus R^{(\aleph_0)} &\cong P \oplus (Q \oplus P) \oplus (Q \oplus P) \oplus \dots \\ &\cong (P \oplus Q) \oplus (P \oplus Q) \oplus \dots \cong R^{(\aleph_0)} \end{aligned}$$

and therefore  $P \oplus R^{(\aleph)} \cong R^{(\aleph)}$  for every infinite cardinal  $\aleph$ .

**Corollary 2.2.** *Let  $P = \bigoplus_i P_i$  be the direct sum of some infinite number  $\aleph$  of finitely generated projective modules  $P_i$  over some ring  $R$ . Suppose that at least  $\aleph$  of the summands  $P_i$  are isomorphic to some fixed progenerator  $Q$ . Then  $P \cong R^{(\aleph)}$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $P = \bigoplus_{i \in X} P_i$ , and let  $Y$  be the subset of  $X$  of all indices  $i \in X$  with  $P_i \cong Q$ , so that  $X$  and  $Y$  have the same cardinality  $\aleph$ . The case  $X = Y$  is Eilenberg's Lemma, so that we can suppose  $X \neq Y$ . By Eilenberg's Lemma, the direct sum  $\bigoplus_{i \in Y} P_i$  is free, i.e.,  $\bigoplus_{i \in Y} P_i \cong R^{(\aleph)}$ . Thus

$$P = (\bigoplus_{i \in Y} P_i) \oplus (\bigoplus_{i \in X \setminus Y} P_i) \cong R^{(\aleph)} \oplus (\bigoplus_{i \in X \setminus Y} P_i) \cong \bigoplus_{i \in X \setminus Y} (P_i \oplus R^{(\aleph)})$$

because  $X \times (X \setminus Y)$  and  $X$  have the same cardinality  $\aleph$ . But  $P_i \oplus R^{(\aleph)} \cong R^{(\aleph)}$  by Eilenberg's trick. Thus  $P$  is free.  $\square$

**Corollary 2.3.** *Let  $P = \bigoplus_i P_i$  be the direct sum of  $\aleph$  progenerators  $P_i$  over some ring  $R$ , where  $\aleph > \max\{|R|, \aleph_0\}$ . Then  $P \cong R^{(\aleph)}$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $\alpha = \max\{|R|, \aleph_0\}$ . Then  $R^{(\aleph)}$  has cardinality  $\alpha$ , so that it has at most  $\alpha$  finitely generated submodules. Thus there are at most  $\alpha$  finitely generated projective right  $R$ -modules up to isomorphism.

Therefore some isomorphism class must be repeated at least  $\aleph$  times among the  $P_i$ . Therefore Corollary 2.2, implies  $P \cong R^{(\aleph)}$ .  $\square$

### 3. NONUNIQUE $\aleph_0$ -ROOTS

**Example 3.1.** Progenerators  $P \not\cong Q$  that are indecomposable modules with semilocal endomorphism rings and satisfy  $P^{(\aleph_0)} \cong Q^{(\aleph_0)}$ .

*Proof.* Let  $e$  be a positive integer  $\geq 2$ . Then there is a (noncommutative) integral domain  $\Lambda$  that is a module-finite algebra over a discrete valuation ring  $V$  and such that  $\Lambda$  has an indecomposable progenerator  $P$  such that  $P^{(e)}$  maps onto  $\Lambda$ , but  $P^{(d)}$  does not map onto  $\Lambda$  for  $d < e$  [L, Theorem 3.1].

Since  $e \geq 2$  we have  $P \not\cong \Lambda$ ; and by Eilenberg's Lemma we have  $P^{(\aleph_0)} \cong \Lambda^{(\aleph_0)}$ . Thus it suffices to show: (i)  $\Lambda$  is an indecomposable left  $\Lambda$ -module, and (ii) the left  $\Lambda$ -modules  $\Lambda$  and  $P$  both have semilocal endomorphism rings.

Since  $\Lambda$  is a domain,  $\Lambda$  has no non-trivial idempotents. Thus (i) follows from the fact that  $\Lambda$  is anti-isomorphic to the endomorphism ring of  $\Lambda$  as a  $\Lambda$ -module. Let  $M$  be any finitely generated  $\Lambda$ -module. Then the endomorphism ring of  $M$  is a module-finite  $V$ -algebra, and is therefore a semilocal ring. This applies, in particular, to the left  $\Lambda$ -modules  $\Lambda$  and  $P$ , and therefore proves (ii).  $\square$

### 4. NON-FREE PROGENERATOR SUM

**Example 4.1.** A ring  $R$  with progenerators  $P_n$ ,  $n \geq 1$ , such that the direct sum  $G = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} P_n$  is not free.

Let  $\mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}$  denote the nonnegative real numbers. There is a right self-injective ring  $R$  whose monoid  $V(R)$  of isomorphism classes of finitely generated projective modules is isomorphic to the additive monoid  $\mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}$ , and such that the isomorphism  $V(R) \cong \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}$  takes the isomorphism class of  $R_R$  to the real number 1. This is a special case of [GW, Corollary 5–3.15] (which characterizes which monoids occur as  $V(R)$  for regular right self-injective rings) and [GW, Proposition 3–1.11].

In more detail, there is — for every  $\alpha \in \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}$  — a finitely generated projective right  $R$ -module  $Q_\alpha$  such that the following properties hold.

- (i) For every finitely generated projective  $R$ -module  $Q$  there exists a unique  $\alpha \in \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}$  such that  $Q \cong Q_\alpha$ .
- (ii)  $Q_1 \cong R_R$ .
- (iii)  $Q_\alpha \oplus Q_\beta \cong Q_{\alpha+\beta}$  for every  $\alpha, \beta$ .
- (iv)  $Q_\alpha$  is isomorphic to a direct summand of  $Q_\beta$  if and only if  $\alpha \leq \beta$ .

We claim:  $Q_\alpha$  is a progenerator whenever  $\alpha \neq 0$ . We have  $n\alpha \geq 1$  for some positive integer  $n$ . Therefore, by (ii)–(iv),  $R = Q_1$  is isomorphic to a direct summand of  $(Q_\alpha)^{(n)} \cong Q_{n\alpha}$ , proving the claim.

Set  $G = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} Q_{1/2^n}$  where summation extends over all positive integers  $n$ .

We claim that there is a monomorphism of  $G$  into  $R$  because  $\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} 1/2^n = 1$ . In more detail, there is a decomposition  $R = A_1 \oplus B_1$  with  $A_1 \cong B_1 \cong Q_{1/2}$ , by (ii) and (iii). Similarly, there is a decomposition  $B_1 = A_2 \oplus B_2$  with  $A_2 \cong B_2 \cong Q_{1/2^2}$ . Thus  $R = A_1 \oplus A_2 \oplus B_2$ . Continuing in this way we build a submodule  $A = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$  of  $R$ , such that every  $A_n \cong Q_{1/2^n}$  and hence  $A \cong G$ . ( $A \neq R$  because  $R_R$  is finitely generated while the infinite direct sum  $A$  is not.)

Let us prove that  $G$  is not free. Assume the contrary, that is,  $G \cong R^{(\aleph)}$  for some cardinal  $\aleph$ . Since  $G$  is an infinite direct sum of nonzero modules,  $G$  is not cyclic. Therefore  $\aleph \geq 2$ . Thus there is a monomorphism of  $R_R^{(2)}$  into  $G$ , and hence into  $R_R$ . Since  $R_R$  is injective, this implies that  $R_R^{(2)} = Q_2$  is isomorphic to a direct summand of  $R = Q_1$ . This contradiction of property (iv) completes the proof.

#### REFERENCES

- [B] H. Bass, “Big projective modules are free”, *Israel J. Math.* **7** (1963), pp. 24–31.
- [C] V. Camillo, “Morita equivalence and infinite matrix rings”, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **90** (1984) pp. 186–188.
- [F] A. Facchini, *Module Theory: Endomorphism Rings and Direct Sum Decompositions in some classes of Modules*, Birkhäuser, Basel, 1998.
- [GW] K. R. Goodearl and F. Wehrung, “The complete dimension theory of partially ordered systems with equivalence and orthogonality”, (preprint, presently available at [www.math.ucsb.edu/~goodearl/preprints.html](http://www.math.ucsb.edu/~goodearl/preprints.html)).
- [L] L. S. Levy, “Projectives of large uniform-rank, in Krull dimension 1”, *Bulletin London Math. Soc.* **21** (1989), 57–64.
- [P] P. Prihoda, “On uniserial modules that are not quasi-small”, manuscript, 2004.

A. FACCHINI, DIPARTIMENTO DI MATEMATICA PURA E APPLICATA, UNIVERSITÀ DI PADOVA, VIA BELZONI 7, 35131 PADOVA, ITALY

*E-mail address:* [facchini@math.unipd.it](mailto:facchini@math.unipd.it)

L. S. LEVY, MATHEMATICS DEPARTMENT, UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA, LINCOLN, NE 68588–0323 USA, MAILING ADDRESS: 2528 VAN HISE AVE., MADISON, WI 53705-3850 USA

*E-mail address:* [levy@math.wisc.edu](mailto:levy@math.wisc.edu)